



Regular Council Meeting

To:	Mayor and Council
Date:	June 5, 2023
From:	Chris Allison, Parks and Facilities Manager
Report Number:	Parks and Facilities 2023-03
Subject:	Parks and Recreation Plan – Vision 2035 Community Forum and Millbrook Arena

Recommendations:

1. That Council provide direction to Staff regarding the future use of the Millbrook Arena property; and
2. That Council's direction be carried forward in Phase Two the Parks and Recreation Plan – Vision 2035.

Overview:

On May 10, 2023, a Community Forum was hosted by Robert Lockhart of The ReThink Group at the township office Council Chambers to provide more public input and learn more about demand for culture, recreation and parks in the Township of Cavan Monaghan. The event was widely marketed through an advertisement in the Millbrook Times, the Township website and social media outlets. Twenty eight residents attended the event in person in addition the Forum was livestreamed to the community. The ReThink Group has provided a detailed report outlining information derived from the Community Forum. (Attachment 1)

Participants were asked to discuss and provide input on two questions.

Question: 1

1. What are your top two or three priorities for improved and new facilities and parks?
2. Options for the Future of the Millbrook Arena?

Question: 2. Options for the Future of the Millbrook Arena?

Participants were provided with the 4 survey questions asked in the household survey administered in 2022.

4 Survey Questions are below

Option One

Invest in the order of \$5.25 million into the building and site to maintain the facility as status quo for another 25 years and to renovate it to meet accessibility requirements (by 2025). This investment would support current uses e.g., soccer and lacrosse. Accessibility deficiencies must be corrected by 2025. This option does not include any other functional or aesthetic improvements to the interior and exterior of the building. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming. Estimated costs depending on the works required.

Option Two

Invest considerably more than \$5.25 million into the building and site (interior and exterior) to extend its life for another 25 years and increase its functionality and appeal to support a few more uses. Possible new uses will depend on how the interior might be able to be transformed. The intent would be for the facility to be utilized year-round, including a new exterior design. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming. Estimated costs depending on the works required.

Option Three

Replace the building with a high-quality downtown community park that may accommodate some combination of facilities such as a farmer's market, shows/exhibitions, an outdoor stage or gazebo, pathways, gardens, trees, a picnic area, an outdoor exercise gym, an unstructured grass area, a public square, etc. With the proposed closure of Needlers Lane, the park could be integrated into the surrounding parkland and facilities. Via walkways, the park would be linked to the commercial component of the downtown, Old Millbrook School Park and the adjacent conservation area and pond. Costs unknown depending on works required.

Option Four

Sell the property and allow for a developer or business opportunity to invest in the downtown. This would support urban redevelopment plans and help to satisfy the need for additional commercial opportunities and or residential development in the downtown. This option would also support intensification requirements.

Each group at the Community Forum was asked to discuss the options, record the comments and decide which option their group most supported. The results of this survey were very similar to the household survey conducted in the summer of 2022. In the household survey, 82.5% of respondents chose Option Three, 75% of Community Forum attendees chose Option Three.

Community opinion about the future of the Millbrook Arena has been researched by ReThink Group in the following ways:

- The Household Survey (summer, 2022),
- The Community Forum (May 10, 2023),
- Surveys to Committees of Council and other community groups (2023), and
- Submissions/briefs from individuals and organizations (ongoing).

The responses from all community engagement ranks Option Three as the top choice amongst the community.

The ReThink Group has provided a report dated June 5, 2023, Information about the Millbrook Arena Emanating from the Parks and Recreation Plan. (Attachment 2). This report outlines key findings and conclusions to date regarding the Millbrook Arena. Technical information, summary of information on the Millbrook Arena, demand for arts and culture, community opinion about the future of the Millbrook Arena along with the pros and cons of the four survey options.

Option Three - Downtown Park at Millbrook Arena site

ReThink reached out to Basterfield & Associates (B&A) to provide some additional park costs to better understand what park development could possibly cost. This is a high level Budget Cost Estimate for the lands that currently house the Millbrook Arena based on a the conceptual design from the 2013 Township of Cavan Monaghan Downtown Revitalization Strategy. (Attachment 3) Material types, structure types, and size or area dedicated for facilities can impact the final costs by as much as 35% increase or decrease. Ancillary construction costs for parking and road adjustments, demolition, and removals are not included. These costs are estimated.

The following features and areas are included in this park plan costing:

1. An open lawn or permeable surface suitable for farmers market, craft shows, event staging small theatre or movies etc. Size similar to the arena building footprint.
2. A medium size play area for toddler/junior use.
3. Accessible hard surface pathways around the open lawn/permeable surface area.
4. Additional footbridge between Needlers Lane and Distillery Street linking to walkway up to the Old Millbrook School Park.
5. New footbridge and path linking to King Street East via laneway beside Royal Canadian Legion.
6. New picnic shelter beside Needles Mill building facing the open lawn to serve as day-to-day shade shelter and small venue event stage.
7. Pedestrian scale park lighting.
8. Ramped walkway from Needlers Mill up to the Mill Pond. Walkway does not cut into or impact the berm slopes that holdback the pond.
9. Naturalization plantings along the creek (north extent of the site).
10. General plantings of trees and shrubs to provide shade, definition of space and aesthetics.

Based on inclusions listed a high level order of magnitude costing estimate has been supplied by B&A. The total budget for a downtown park at the arena site is estimated at

+/- \$1,105,000 and could vary between 25-35% based on design, materials choices and additions or deletions to the development program.

Staff has been in contact with Barry Bryan Associates (BBA) in hopes to explore high level budgetary numbers based on their previous investigation, reporting and general understanding of the building should Council wish to continue to utilize some form of the Millbrook Arena. Council's direction regarding the future use of the Millbrook Arena and property will determine estimated construction costs to address high priority repairs required over the next few years, accessibility upgrades, remediate mould, address roof/insulation system and replace ceiling on second floor and or closing off the second level. An Order of Magnitude Estimate and report can then be prepared based on Council's decision on the Millbrook Arena.

Background Millbrook Arena:

March 6, 2023 Parks and Facilities Report 2023-01 Parks and Recreation Plan Background Report (Phase One) was presented to Council. Part of Phase One review of the Millbrook Arena was the hiring of Barry Bryan Associates (BBA) to provide an updated review of the Millbrook Arena building condition assessment report dated August 7, 2019 (BBA Project No. 19167) which was outlining observations and recommendations for the Millbrook Arena located at 4 Needlers Lane, Millbrook Ontario.

Kirkland Engineering LTD. Completed an Electrical Site Condition Assessment Report dated September 6, 2019 and a Mechanical Site Assessment Report dated September 3, 2019 as part of the (BBA) Millbrook Arena Building Assessment Report in 2019.

The total Construction Budget could be approximately \$4.45M of hard construction cost, and \$5.25M with modest contingencies. Due to the age and conditions of the existing facility, the upgrades would be considered major and would require substantial funding to achieve. Additional funding may also be required to convert the building to a different use depending on the alternate uses considered. Development Charges could not be used for any redevelopment works at the Millbrook Arena.

Outlined in the Millbrook Arena BBA Structural Investigation Report moisture damage was observed at the underside of the insulation in the second floor area. Numerous signs of moisture damage were observed by the water stains and plastic breakthroughs of the ceiling tiles. A Designated Substance Survey was recommended to be completed to finalize an accurate budget as there may be abatement considerations which are currently unknown. Cambium Inc. was contracted to perform air samples at the Millbrook Arena which took place March 13, 2023 and a Designated Substances Survey was conducted on April 4, 2023 outlined in Parks and Facilities report 2023-02 Parks and Recreation Plan – Phase One Community Engagement and Millbrook Arena Update Report.


With the presence of mould within the facility, Cambium Inc. performed a Designated Substances Survey to further investigate mould growth. Mould growth was identified on the fiberglass insulation in the ceiling space of the second floor and is presumed to be present on all fiberglass insulation on the ceilings above the playing surface portion of the building. Water damaged drywall was identified in multiple areas throughout the second floor. It is recommended to remove all fiberglass insulation above ceilings

throughout the building and correct all sources of moisture intrusion prior to reinstatement.

An order of magnitude estimated budget was provided by BBA for the Millbrook Arena and property with a future Capital investment. (Schedule A)

Additional funding will be required for Hazardous Materials Abatement for the safe removal of contaminants found identified in the Designated Substances Survey.

Schedule A

Order of Magnitude Budget				Barry Bryan Associates	
Millbrook Arena State of Good Repair				Architects, Engineers, Project Managers	
September 15, 2022					
Gross Floor Area:			25000 SF		
				Unit Cost	
Building Shell			\$	1,250,000.00	\$ 50.00
Roofing	\$	450,000.00			\$ 18.00
Exterior Enclosure	\$	800,000.00			\$ 32.00
Building Interiors			\$	950,000.00	\$ 38.00
Interior Repairs	\$	200,000.00			\$ 8.00
Accessibility Upgrades	\$	750,000.00			\$ 30.00
Mechanical			\$	1,125,000.00	\$ 45.00
Plumbing and Fixtures	\$	250,000.00			\$ 10.00
HVAC and Controls	\$	800,000.00			\$ 32.00
Life Safety	\$	75,000.00			\$ 3.00
Electrical			\$	500,000.00	\$ 20.00
Lighting, Devices and Fire Alarm	\$	500,000.00			\$ 20.00
Site Work Allowance			\$	200,000.00	\$ 8.00
Ancillary Work			\$	50,000.00	\$ 2.00
Demolition	\$	50,000.00			\$ 2.00
Subtotal			\$	4,075,000.00	\$ 163.00
General Requirements			\$	366,750.00	\$ 14.67
Contractor's General Requirements	6%	\$ 244,500.00			\$ 9.78
Contractor's Fees	3%	\$ 122,250.00			\$ 4.89
Subtotal (Hard Construction)			\$	4,441,750.00	\$ 177.67
Construction Allowances			\$	799,515.00	\$ 31.98
Escalation	8.0%	\$ 355,340.00			\$ 14.21
Design Contingency	5.0%	\$ 222,087.50			\$ 8.88
Construction Contingency	5.0%	\$ 222,087.50			\$ 8.88
Total Construction Cost Incl. Allowances			\$	5,241,265.00	\$ 209.65

For information, a quote was obtained from Salandria LTD. for the demolition of the Millbrook Arena on March 30, 2023. The demolition price was estimated at \$200,000.00. Not included in the quote is Hazardous Materials Abatement, Utility disconnects, removal and disposal of contaminated soil, removal or decommissioning of water wells, AST/UST, septic tanks, tests, analysis, backfill and restoration. The results of the Designated Substance Survey will determine additional fees required relating to the Hazardous Materials Abatement.

In 2021, we were advised that an ICIP: Community, Culture and Recreation Stream - Rehabilitation and Renovation Intake grant be received in the amount of \$966,000.00 for renovating the Millbrook Arena, should Council wish to carry out a renovation of the aging facility only after public engagement was received on the future use. At the time of the application in 2019, estimates were made to optimize existing infrastructure, make

upgrades and repairs to expand programming revenues and bring the first floor accessibility up to meet Ontario Standards.

ICIP Contribution Funding Sources

Federal	40%	\$386,400.00
Provincial	33.33%	\$321,967.80
Ultimate Recipient	26.67%	<u>\$257,632.20</u>
Total		\$966,000.00

This grant is still identified under our draft Capital projects until the Plan is finalized and direction is provided.

Conclusion:

One of the purposes of the Parks and Recreation Plan is to determine the future of the Millbrook Arena/property. Currently, the building does not meet accessibility standards of the Province of Ontario i.e. washrooms, service counters, spectator areas, entrance etc. It is assumed that public buildings should meet a modern standard to serve the public should municipal assets be considered for future use.

As previously discussed the future of the Millbrook Arena and property will influence decisions about how best to provide and locate other culture and recreation facilities. Currently, there are two main users of the facility and have indicated they wish to continue to use the facility from September to May and would like to continue to use it until a more usable and appealing facility becomes available.

Due to the township and surrounding community's limitation on indoor turf playing surfaces, township staff, as directed by Council, are committed to operating the Millbrook Arena status quo seasonally from September through May. This will also be dependant upon the operations and building conditions being consistently reviewed and monitored for fiscal responsibility and community safety given the condition of the facility.

The Township's consultant will continue to engage and participate with neighbouring communities and stake holders to review any future opportunities or partnerships for similar facilities as part of the plan.

After review of all documentation presented to Council the Staff is seeking Councils direction regarding the future use of the Millbrook Arena property which as mentioned will influence decisions during Phase Two of the Parks and Recreation Plan – Vision 2035 and the remaining lands at the CMCC.

Staff will continue to update the information provided by the Township's consultant on the Parks and Recreation Plan – Vision 2035 as received by The ReThink Group www.cavanmonaghan.net/parksandrecreationmasterplan.

Financial Impact:

The funds for Phase Two of this project are identified and approved in the 2023 Capital Budget.

Attachments:

Attachment No. 1 – Community Forum

Attachment No. 2 – Information About the Millbrook Arena Emanating from the Parks and Recreation Plan

Attachment No. 3 – Cavan Monaghan Parks and Recreation Plan Proposed order of magnitude costing for Downtown Park at Millbrook Arena site

Respectfully Submitted by,

Reviewed by,

Chris Allison
Parks and Facilities Manager

Yvette Hurley
Chief Administrative Officer

Community Forum

Introduction

On May 10, 2023, a Community Forum was held to learn more about demand for culture, recreation and parks in the Township of Cavan Monaghan. The event was widely marketed through an advertisement in the Millbrook Times, the Township website and social media outlets. 28 residents attended the event. The Forum was livestreamed to the community. – joined virtually. Three residents emailed the project right after the Forum with their suggestions. All have been included in report associated with each question.

The evening began with a welcome from the Mayor, followed by a presentation by the Project Director of the results of the research and analysis to date. Since much of the discussion at the Forum was to be on options for the future of the Millbrook Arena, more information was presented about it.

Participants were seated at five tables and were asked to provide input on two questions. Almost an hour was set aside for the group discussion. The questions are provided, and the result of the discussion is summarized below. Each group reported on the highlights of their discussion. Each participant was asked to fill in a short survey to register their opinion about the four options identified for the future of the Millbrook Arena. The evening ended with closing remarks from the facilitator and the Mayor.

The notes from each table have been integrated into a report on the discussion associated with each question.

Discussion Question One: What are your top two or three priorities for improved and new facilities and parks?

Most of the suggestions for additional and improved facilities and parks were only mentioned once across all the groups. The most that anything was suggested was five times. The full list of suggestions is recorded below, including a few suggestions that came from residents who joined the Forum virtually and a few who emailed the project in the days following the Forum.

Requests	Suggested Facility and Park Improvements
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Expand the trail system/Accessible walking paths/ Increase walkability or wheel-ability within the Township – e.g., paved trails, more walkways throughout the Town/ Incorporate unused lands into outdoor barrier-free experiences for those who may have disabilities but would love to access the trail system.

4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Some sort of large field house that is large enough to accommodate a small artificial turf playing field (note that the typical size of an indoor soccer field is 100' x 200'). 4 votes
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Parkland integrated into the downtown/ Downtown playground/Create a Town Square/community green space that allows outdoor activities, socializing, Town initiatives/events – and provides a safe, accessible place for seniors and those with disabilities to enjoy the outdoors. ▪ Outdoor performance venue/band shell. ▪ Improved and more accessible public library building, collection and community programming (combine the two branches, build a new main branch, modernize the existing main branch, create a dedicated 'kids' space). ▪ Space for large meetings and community events/ More affordable meeting spaces for small and medium size meetings
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ More rectangular fields. ▪ Seek partnerships/partner with social services, Five Counties Children Centre, the Public Library, etc. ▪ Partner with the Fair Board to better utilize their space/move the Millbrook Fair to Kawartha Downs and repurpose the current fairground into municipal parkland. ▪ More neighbourhood parks/more parks for kids.
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A one-stop accessible building for all ages. ▪ A multipurpose park. ▪ Baseball diamonds. ▪ Drop-in centre for youth. ▪ Drop-in centre for seniors. ▪ Preschool/daycare facilities. ▪ Youth programs. ▪ Intergenerational programs. ▪ Recreation programs in Millbrook. ▪ Enhance programming for adults and children with disabilities. ▪ Facilities that support structured and unstructured leisure activities. ▪ Gymnasium. ▪ Racquet sports (non-specific). ▪ Indoor performance venue. ▪ Swimming pool (not specific as to indoor or outdoor). ▪ Outdoor swimming pool. ▪ Repurpose Old Millbrook School Park. ▪ More downtown parking. ▪ Not-for-profit childcare programs/Early ON. ▪ Second hockey pad that has multiple sport options for all ages. ▪ Expand the CMCC into a recreational sports centre. Consider adding a dome instead of a second hockey pad (would support activities such as soccer, gymnastics, cheerleading, running club). ▪ Provide bike lanes on roads.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Provide more sidewalks.▪ Accessible parkland.▪ Create a business plan/business case for the recommendations in the Parks and Recreation Plan.
--	---

Discussion Question Two: Options for the Future of the Millbrook Arena

The group was reminded that in the summer of 2022, a household survey was administered to Township residents in support of the Parks and Recreation Plan. The 319 responses from households represented approximately 900 residents. Among many questions, the survey asked for respondent's opinion about four options for the future of the Millbrook Arena.

Each group at the Community Forum was asked to discuss the options, record the comments and decide which option their group most supported. Each group was also provided a one-page information sheet on the Millbrook Arena, including the seven studies that have been recently completed about this facility.

Although not everyone agreed in each group, four of five groups/tables selected **Option Three: Replace the building with a high-quality downtown community park** as the consensus option. One group created a fifth option for which three of the four participants selected. That option was "to do nothing until the existing user groups are accommodated". That sounds a lot like Option Three with the caveat noted below.

Most indicated that the Millbrook Arena should not be demolished until a suitable facility is available that can accommodate current users, especially indoor soccer. One group emphasized that a partnership is a possibility that should be considered. Another group noted the parking challenges at the Millbrook Arena as a serious drawback to its use.

Results of the Individual Surveys about the Future of the Millbrook Arena

Including the two residents who joined the Forum virtually and voted on the four options, there were 28 completed surveys. The results are recorded below.

Rank	The Options
10.7% (3 votes)	Option One Invest in the order of \$5.25 million into the building and site to maintain the facility as status quo for another 25 years and to renovate it to meet accessibility requirements. This investment would only support winter season uses that are similar to current uses e.g., soccer and lacrosse. Accessibility deficiencies must be corrected by 2025. No interior or exterior improvements (other than accessibility upgrades) are included in this option.
0% (0 votes)	Option Two Invest considerably more than \$5.25 million into the building and site (interior and exterior) to extend its life for another 25 years <u>and</u> increase its functionality and appeal to support a few more uses. Possible uses will depend on how the interior might be able to be transformed. The intent would be to have a facility that could be utilized year-round. Even if well utilized year-round, there will likely be an annual operating deficit. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming.
75% (21 votes) See caveat below.	Option Three Replace the building with a high-quality downtown community park that may accommodate some combination of facilities such as a farmer's market, an outdoor stage or gazebo, pathways, gardens, trees, an area for quiet reflection, a picnic area, an outdoor exercise gym, an unstructured grass area, etc. With the proposed closure of Needler's Lane, the park could be integrated into the surrounding parkland and facilities. Via walkways, the park would be linked to the commercial component of the downtown.
0.04% (1 vote)	Option Four Sell the property and allow for a developer or business opportunity to invest in the downtown. This would support urban redevelopment plans and help to satisfy the need for commercial and residential development in the downtown.
0.07% (2 votes)	Option Five Two people voted for an Option 5, although it was not defined. One person asked that more consultation be undertaken to ensure that "the ENTIRE Township community is consulted".

One person did not vote for any of the options, nor did they define a fifth option. They did however, state that the Township should "not tear down the arena until there is a Cavan-based facility that meets the needs of user groups".

Seven of the 21 people (one third) who voted for the option to replace the Millbrook Arena with a downtown park, also included the caveat that the arena remain open until

there is a new facility built that can accommodate current users and programs (indoor soccer and box lacrosse).

For Option One to invest in the order of \$5.25 million in the Millbrook Arena to keep it open in a status quo state for another 25 years, two people questioned the capital cost estimate. They believe it is too high.

Note: The results of this survey are very similar to the results of the household survey conducted in the summer of 2022. In the household survey, 82.5% of respondents chose Option Three. 75% of Community Forum attendees chose Option Three.

Information About the Millbrook Arena Emanating from the Parks and Recreation Plan

Township of Cavan Monaghan

June 5, 2023

**Prepared by:
The Rethink Group
*Leisure Services Planning and Management***

Selwyn, Ontario



Findings and Conclusions to Date Regrading the Millbrook Arena

This report is focussed on the Millbrook Arena. It comprises technical information about the facility, what is known about demand that would relate to this type of facility, community opinion about options for the future of Millbrook Arena, and identification and analysis of options for Council to consider.

Technical Information

The following recent studies have been undertaken to examine the condition and utilization of the Millbrook Arena.

1. **Arena/Community Centre Needs and Feasibility Study, 2014** – The Rethink Group, Leisure Services Planning and Management
2. **Mechanical Site Condition Assessment Report, September 3, 2019** - Kirkland Engineering LTD.
3. **Electrical Site Condition Assessment Report, September 6, 2019** - Kirkland Engineering LTD.
4. **Structural Investigation Report on the Millbrook Arena, 2019** - Barry Bryan Associates, Architects, Engineers, Project Managers
5. **Update of the 2019 Structural Investigation Report to Assess the Feasibility of Renovating the Millbrook Arena or Utilizing the Space in Other Ways, 2022** - Barry Bryan Associates, Architects, Engineers, Project Managers
6. **Background Report in support of Vision 2035, The Parks and Recreation Plan, Cavan Monaghan Township, 2023** - The Rethink Group, Leisure Services Planning and Management
7. **Designated Substances Survey of the Millbrook Arena, 2023** – Cambium Inc.

Summary of Information About the Millbrook Arena

- The 72-year-old building is in poor and deteriorating physical condition.
- The building does not meet provincial accessibility standards for community buildings. This must be addressed by 2025. (Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act).
- Mould (ceiling insulation throughout the building), Asbestos (tiles, drywall, caulking), Lead (paint), Mercury (lighting), Silica (concrete products) and PCBs (likely in lighting ballasts) were discovered in 2023. However, the air quality is not negatively impacted by mould growth at this time.
- The playing surface is under-sized (75' x 175' – the standard is 100' x 200').
- The facility is mainly used for indoor soccer and by the Arena Lacrosse League (Peterborough Timbermen) during the winter season.
- The facility is extremely underutilized (57% of Prime Time, no Non-Prime Time winter use and no summer use).
- Only the main floor is accessible and used.

- The site is small (0.43 ha./1.05 ac.), there is very limited on-site parking and the building is in a floodplain and susceptible to annual flooding.
- It is estimated that in the order of \$5.25 million will be required to retain the building pretty much “as is” for another 25 years – to support uses similar to the current ones. This does not include dealing with the mould.
- Much more investment will be required to increase functionality, uses and the appeal of the building. Because of the small size of the site, it is unlikely that the building can be enlarged to accommodate additional components. The second-floor multipurpose room could be renovated for community use and municipal programming.
- The cost to keep the building operational for a few more years (post 2025) is not yet known. (removal of mould, roof repair, replacement of the insulation and related works, upgrade accessibility of the main floor to meet provincial standards (by 2025), other high priority repairs).
- Based on similar uses and a September - May season, the annual operating cost is expected to be in the order of \$10,000 to \$15,000.
- A minimum of \$200,000 is estimated to demolish the building, plus the cost to remove hazardous materials and to perform other tasks to prepare the site for a new use.
- A \$708,367 grant has been approved to assist with renovation of the facility.
- As directed by Council, the Municipality is committed to operating the Millbrook Arena status quo annually from September through May, dependent upon the operations and building conditions being consistently reviewed and monitored for fiscal responsibility and community safety, given the condition of the facility.
- Financial Implication: An investment in this building will reduce the amount of money available to invest in parks and other culture and recreation facilities throughout the Township over the new decade and beyond.

Demand for Arts and Culture - Related to Facilities Like the Millbrook Arena

Since the Millbrook Arena is now a ‘turf floor’ facility, information about current and future demand will focus on a fieldhouse type of facility that, at minimum would have a 100’ x 200’ turf floor that could be rolled up and/or covered with a hard-surface floor in the summer and when necessary for other programming during the fall, winter and spring seasons. To optimize the facility, it would be heated and airconditioned to accommodate year-round use, and would have change rooms, washrooms, a foyer, storage, and possible other components and features. It could be attached to the Cavan Monaghan Community Centre, or it could be located in Maple Leaf Park. A case could be made for either option. However, if attached to the CMCC, the arena floor and multipurpose rooms would complement activities in the field house.

The household survey identified types of programming and activities that could be accommodated in a fieldhouse or a gymnasium type of facility (e.g., day camps, group fitness, Yoga, basketball, dance programs, gymnastics, volleyball, pickleball, children’s

programming, indoor soccer, floor hockey, youth programming, badminton, older adult programming).

One question in the household survey asked about priorities for investing in various types of indoor and outdoor culture and recreation facilities. An indoor soccer facility ranked 27th out of 36 listed facilities and a gymnasium ranked 16th. The survey didn't specifically ask about a fieldhouse.

Increasingly, municipalities are including a gymnasium in multi-facility community centres. This trend is resulting from the unreliability of access to school gymnasiums and increasing demand for municipal programming and events that require a gymnasium.

However, it should be noted that very few communities have a fieldhouse or an indoor soccer facility. Therefore, Cavan Monaghan is quite unique in having such a facility, which only came about because the Millbrook Arena recently became available for non-ice uses after the new CMCC opened.

The following are examples of the types of culture and recreation uses/programming that could be accommodated in a fieldhouse type of facility. Depending on the style and size of the facility, other uses may also be able to be accommodated. Many of these and additional activities are also well suited to a gymnasium.

- Indoor soccer,
- Field lacrosse,
- Ball hockey,
- Roller blading,
- Pickleball,
- Some types of traditional gym sports,
- Floor-based group fitness/wellness programming,
- Dance programs,
- Child and youth day camps,
- Performances/shows (drama, music, dance, shows) – with a portable stage and if the acoustics and the sound system are adequate to support quality experiences,
- Community gatherings/events,
- Religious services,
- Winter farmers market,
- Exhibitions/car shows,
- Trade shows, and
- Information/education programming.

Community Opinion About the Future of the Millbrook Arena

Community opinion about the future of the Millbrook Arena has been researched in the following ways:

- The Household Survey (summer, 2022),
- The Community Forum (May 10, 2023),
- Surveys to committees of Council and other community groups (2023), and
- Submissions/briefs from individuals and organisations (ongoing).

Via the Household Survey, the Community Forum and surveys to relevant Committees of Council, respondents were asked to rank the following four options for the future of the Millbrook Arena:

Option One

Invest in the order of \$5.25 million into the building and site to maintain the facility as status quo for another 25 years and to renovate it to meet accessibility requirements (by 2025). This investment would support current uses e.g., soccer and lacrosse. Accessibility deficiencies must be corrected by 2025. This option does not include any other functional or aesthetic improvements to the interior and exterior of the building. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming.

Option Two

Invest considerably more than \$5.25 million into the building and site (interior and exterior) to extend its life for another 25 years and increase its functionality and appeal to support a few more uses. Possible new uses will depend on how the interior might be able to be transformed. The intent would be for the facility to be utilized year-round, including a new exterior design. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming.

Option Three

Replace the building with a high-quality downtown community park that may accommodate some combination of facilities such as a farmer's market, shows/exhibitions, an outdoor stage or gazebo, pathways, gardens, trees, a picnic area, an outdoor exercise gym, an unstructured grass area, a public square, etc. With the proposed closure of Needler's Lane, the park could be integrated into the surrounding parkland and facilities. Via walkways, the park would be linked to the commercial component of the downtown, Old Millbrook School Park and the adjacent conservation area and pond.

Option Four

Sell the property and allow for a developer or business opportunity to invest in the downtown. This would support urban redevelopment plans and help to satisfy the need for additional commercial opportunities and or residential development in the downtown. This option would also support intensification requirements.

The overwhelming top choice is **Option Three** – to replace the arena with a high-quality downtown park. See below for the response from all of the sources of community engagement that asked about the future of the Millbrook Arena.

- | | |
|--|-----------|
| ▪ Household Survey | 82.5% |
| ▪ Community Forum | 75% |
| ▪ Sustainability Advisory Committee | Ranked #1 |
| ▪ Municipal Revitalization and Heritage Advisory Committee | Ranked #1 |

- Millbrook Business Improvement Area Executive Committee Ranked #1
- Millbrook Valley Trails Advisory Committee Ranked #1

Pros and Cons of Three Options for Council to Consider

To further assist Council, the pros and cons of three options defining the possible future of the Millbrook Arena and site have been prepared by the consultant and municipal staff. Please note that Option Two is a **new option** that emerged from the Community Forum. This new option is a variation on Option One. Option Three is the “park” option. They represent three directions for the future of the Millbrook Arena and site that Council may now want to consider and evaluate.

Option One: Invest \$5-6 million into the Millbrook Arena to maintain it for another 25 years in a status quo state, other than completing the required accessibility upgrades by 2025, and completing mould mitigation immediately.

Option Two (a variation on Option One): Keep the Millbrook Arena open for a few more years, in the hope of having a facility available to accommodate indoor soccer by that time. This option will require completing the required accessibility upgrades by 2025, completing mould mitigation immediately, and completing all high priority repairs that are necessary in the near term. An estimate of cost for these works is not available at this time.

Option Three: Replace the Millbrook Arena with a high-quality downtown park that would be integrated into adjacent public open space, the historic downtown and Old Millbrook School Park. This option is estimated to cost between \$830,000 and \$1,500,000.

The pros and cons of the three options are identified in Pages 6-8.

The Pros and Cons of Investing \$5-6 Million into the Millbrook Arena to Maintain it Status Quo for Another 25 Years

Pros	Cons
<p>Provide a winter home for: Indoor soccer (although on an under-sized playing surface) – for as long as the Soccer Club wants to remain at the Millbrook Arena.</p> <p>Box/arena lacrosse (for as long as they are viable and want to remain at the Millbrook Arena).</p> <p>The second-floor multipurpose room can be rejuvenated and utilized in the fall-winter-spring seasons for programming and community events.</p>	<p>It is estimated that between \$5 and 6 million will be required to maintain the facility in a safe, but status quo state for another 25 years, including the items identified and costed in the BBA report, not including the following items/actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Immediately remove and replace the mouldy insulation and remove the mould from the ceiling cavity. ▪ Deal with other identified hazardous materials as/when required. ▪ Replace the playing surface carpet (near future). <p>Even with that substantial investment,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The facility will not be improved, beyond the required accessibility upgrades and the potential to reopen the second-floor multipurpose room. ▪ Without A/C, the facility will only be used in the fall-winter-spring seasons. ▪ The interior and exterior appearance of the facility will not be improved. ▪ Other spaces in the lower level would not be repurposed for community use. ▪ Because the way the facility was built, the construction materials, and its overall condition, the facility has a high carbon footprint. <p>That substantial investment in the Millbrook Arena will take away from the financial resources available for other facilities and parks.</p> <p>The return on that substantial investment is limited to providing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A substandard winter home for indoor soccer and box/arena lacrosse for as long as they are viable and interested in using the facility. ▪ The three-season availability of a rejuvenated second-floor multipurpose room for programming and community events. <p>The Timbermen Lacrosse team could fold or move at any time.</p> <p>Maple Leaf Cavan FC will likely move to a better facility if one becomes available. Both the KPRD School Board and the City of Peterborough are actively investigating the feasibility of constructing a large field house that would accommodate indoor soccer and other activities.</p> <p>If both lacrosse and soccer move, there are no known users for the turf floor. If the carpet is removed, activities like winter roller skating, pickleball and ball hockey could be tried.</p> <p>Maintaining the Millbrook Arena for another 25 years will contribute less to downtown Millbrook than an attractive, high quality and busy park/community square that will be linked to King Street, Old Millbrook School Park, the Public Library, Millbrook Valley Trails and the ORCA lands – and support a wide variety of culture and recreation activities (e.g., farmers market, craft and art shows, concerts in the park, community events and celebrations, picnics and lunches, quiet relaxation, pond viewing, trail walking, fishing, skating, etc.)</p>

The Pros and Cons of Keeping the Millbrook Arena Open for a Few More Years and Then Decommission It

Pros	Cons
<p>A winter home will be provided for indoor soccer and box/arena lacrosse for a few more years.</p>	<p>At least the following actions and investments will be required to keep the facility operational and safe for a few more years:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Remove and replace the mouldy insulation throughout the facility. ▪ Remove any mould found within the ceiling cavity. ▪ Removing the insulation may require a new interior ceiling liner and other items. ▪ Repair or replace the roof and any other areas of water intrusion into the ceiling. ▪ Replace water-damaged drywall in the lower level of the facility. ▪ Complete the necessary accessibility upgrades to the lower level of the facility (if the facility is to be used past 2025). ▪ Repair and/or replace any other items that are required in the next few years. <p>The estimated cost for the above upgrades, repairs and replacements associated with this option is not available at this time.</p> <p>With that investment (TBD),</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The facility will not be improved, beyond the required accessibility upgrades. ▪ The second-floor multipurpose room will not be available. ▪ Without A/C, the facility will not be used in the summer. ▪ The interior and exterior appearance of the facility will not be improved. ▪ Other spaces in the lower level will not be repurposed for community use. <p>That investment (TBD) in the Millbrook Arena will take away from financial resources available for other facilities and parks.</p> <p>The return on that investment is limited to providing a substandard winter home for indoor soccer and box/arena lacrosse for a few more years.</p> <p>The Timbermen Lacrosse team may fold or move at any time.</p> <p>Maple Leaf Cavan FC will likely move to a better facility if one becomes available. Both the KPRD School Board and the City of Peterborough are actively investigating the feasibility of constructing a large field house that would accommodate indoor soccer and other activities.</p> <p>If too much money is invested in this facility, there will be increased incentive to keep it operational and invest more into it, assuming there are viable user groups. That will further reduce available financial resources that could be invested in other facilities and parks - that will provide more value to the community.</p>

The Pros and Cons of Replacing the Millbrook Arena with a Downtown Park

Pros	Cons
<p>Provide a high-quality park (non-sports) in Millbrook's downtown.</p> <p>The park's design will complement the historic character of the downtown.</p> <p>The park's features and activities will support the downtown's commercial activities and will contribute to its revitalization.</p> <p>The indirect economic impact of the park on the downtown will exceed the park's annual operation costs. Additionally, the health benefits of people interacting with the park could be over a million dollars a year, according to a recent University of Waterloo study on a similar park in Peterborough.</p> <p>In addition to the economic benefits, the park will provide considerable social, personal and environmental benefits to the community. The park will also contribute to climate change mitigation, in contrast to the high carbon footprint of the Millbrook Arena.</p> <p>The park <u>could</u> provide venues and features such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ an attractive and supportive location for the farmer's market ▪ a venue for concerts and community events ▪ a venue for craft, art and other shows ▪ a community square/gathering space ▪ walkways within the park and pedestrian linkages into the downtown, Old Millbrook School Park, the adjacent conservation area and the Millbrook Valley Trail network ▪ viewing areas to the pond, creek and Medd's Mountain ▪ picnic areas ▪ a playground ▪ display and pollinator gardens ▪ sun and shade areas ▪ areas for quiet reflection ▪ a natural ice rink on the pond ▪ a fishing wharf at the pond ▪ an area for tobogganing <p>The creation of an extensive, accessible and prominent open space campus encompassing the former Millbrook Arena site, Needler's Lane, Old Millbrook School Park, the adjacent ORCA lands, and the Millbrook Valley Trail lands.</p> <p>By not maintaining the Millbrook Arena for the next 25 years, it is estimated that \$5-6 million in capital costs will be able to be invested elsewhere.</p> <p>By not maintaining the Millbrook Arena for the next 25 years, an estimated \$400,000 - \$500,000 will saved in operating costs.</p>	<p>A downtown winter venue for indoor soccer and arena lacrosse will be lost.</p> <p>There will be a cost to demolish the Millbrook Arena and prepare the site for another use (at least \$200,000).</p> <p>There will be a cost to design, construct and maintain the proposed downtown park. An order of magnitude estimate of capital cost is \$830,000 - \$1,500,000, depending on what is included in the park and the quality of development.</p> <p>There will be little opportunity to generate direct revenue from this type of park.</p> <p>Although relatively low, there will be annual operating costs and long-term upgrades/replacements associated with this type of park.</p>



May 25, 2023

**Cavan Monaghan Parks and Recreation Plan
Proposed order of magnitude costing for Downtown Park at Millbrook Arena site**

A) SCOPE:

As part of the consulting team preparing the Cavan Monaghan Parks and Recreation Plan, Basterfield & Associates (B&A) has prepared the following Budget Cost Estimate for the lands that currently house the Millbrook Arena. The following limitations form the basis for the scope of this cost exercise:

1. The proposed budget numbers are order of magnitude costing only and are based on B&A's experience with design of parks and urban squares.
2. This cost estimate is not based on any current design development for the property and therefore proposed activities, uses, and materials are variable and cannot be fully quantified.
3. The preliminary development area plan prepared by B&A for the Downtown Revitalization project (2013) has been used as a general basis for this costing. (see image below)
4. A well developed and community driven program (wish list) for activities, design features, and uses within the park should be developed in order to move the costing to a more accurate level.
5. Choice of material types, structure types, and size or area dedicated for facilities can impact the final costs by as much as 35% increase or decrease.
6. Ancillary construction costs for trail linkages, parking and road adjustments, demolition, and removals are not included.



B) PARK DEVELOPMENT INCLUSIONS (development program):

The following features and areas are included in this park plan costing:

1. An open lawn or permeable surface suitable for farmers market, craft shows, event staging small theatre or movies etc. Size similar to the arena building footprint.
2. A medium size play area for toddler/junior use.
3. Accessible hard surface pathways around the open lawn/permeable surface area.
4. Additional foot bridge between Needler's Lane and Distillery Street linking to walkway up to the Old Millbrook School Park.
5. New footbridge and path linking to King Street East via laneway beside Royal Canadian Legion.

6. New picnic shelter beside Needles Mill building facing the open lawn to serve as day-to-day shade shelter and small venue event stage.
7. Pedestrian scale park lighting
8. Ramped walkway from Needlers Mill up to the Mill Pond. Walkway does not cut into or impact the berm slopes that holdback the pond.
9. Naturalization plantings along the creek (north extent of the site)
10. General plantings of trees and shrubs to provide shade, definition of space and aesthetics.

C. BUDGET COSTS:

Based on the size of the site, expected post demolition site conditions and current construction market costs the following order of magnitude costs could be considered for developing the site as a village green parkland and cultural centre typology.

Park Features (from Part B above)	Budget Costs (in thousands)
An open lawn or permeable surface suitable for farmers market, craft shows, event staging small theatre, or movies etc. Size similar to the arena building footprint plus adjacent areas and connections.	200
A medium size play area for toddler/junior use.	100
Accessible hard surface pathways around the open lawn/permeable surface area (including benches and picnic table)	120
Additional foot bridge and path between Needler’s Lane and Distillery Street linking to walkway up to the Old Millbrook School Park	85
Footbridge and path linking to King Street East via laneway beside Royal Canadian Legion.	85
New picnic shelter beside Needles Mill building facing the open lawn to serve as day-to-day shade shelter, and small venue event stage. Includes electrical.	250
Pedestrian scale park lighting	100
Ramped walkway from Needlers Mill up to the Mill Pond. Walkway does not cut into or impact the pond dike.	80
Naturalization plantings along the creek (north extent of the site)	35
General plantings of trees and shrubs to provide shade, definition of space and aesthetics.	50
Total Budget Cost	+/- \$1,105,000

Note: Budget estimate could vary between 25-35% based on design, material choices, and additions or deletions to the development program.